World Sailing Council Minutes

The World Sailing Council met between 09:30 – 18:00 hours Friday 2 November and between 09:30 – 18:00 on Saturday 3 November 2018 at the Hyatt Regency Hotel, Sarasota, United States of America

Please refer to the World Sailing website www.sailing.org for the details of the submissions referred to in these minutes.

1. Opening of the Meeting 3 7. CEO Report and Commercial Update 15
2. Report from the President 3 8. Members 15
3. Minutes of the Previous Meeting 7 9. Events 16
4. 2024 Olympic Sailing Competition 7 10. Reports and Recommendations Not Based On
5. Submissions 10 Submission 16
6. Finance 14 11. Any Other Business 19

Before commencing the business of the meeting, those who were present stood for a minute’s silence in memory of colleagues, friends and sailors who have passed away since the last meeting of Council: Olympic medallist Donald S Cohan, Olympian and coach Colin Smith, the first disabled woman to sail around Great Britain Hilary Lister, International Race Official Guillermo Patino, former Committee member Niels Ehrhardt and former Review Board Member John Room.

Present:

Kim Anderson (DEN) President
Jan Dawson (NZL) Vice-President
Torben Grael (BRA) Vice-President
Ana Sanchez del Campo Ferrer (ESP) Vice-President
Nadine Stegenwalner (GER) Vice-President
Gary Jobson (USA) Vice-President
Quanhai Li (CHN) Vice-President
Yann Rocherieux (FRA) Athletes’ Commission Representative
Andy Hunt (GBR) Chief Executive Officer (non-voting)
Dick Batt (GBR) Representatives of Group A – United Kingdom & Ireland
Marcus Spillane (IRL) and for various items Harry Hermon (IRL) was Alternate
Timo Hass (GER), Alternate for Goetz-Ulf Jungmichel (GER) Representatives of Group B – Central Europe
Georgy Wossala (HUN) Representatives of Group C - East Europe
Tomasz Chamera (POL) Representatives of Group D – South Europe
Kamen Fillyov (BUL) Walter Cavallucci (ITA)
Nicolas Henard (FRA), Alternate for Jean-Luc Denecheau (FRA) Nicolas Henard (FRA), Alternate for Jean-Luc Denecheau (FRA)
Zvi Ziblat (ISR), Alternate for Totos Theodossiou (CYP) Zvi Ziblat (ISR), Alternate for Totos Theodossiou (CYP)
Josep M. Pla (AND), Alternate for Antonio Roquette (POR) Representative of Group E – Iberian Peninsula

Peter van den Bossche (BEL) Representatives of Group F – Low Countries

Hans Natorp (DEN) Representatives of Group G – North Europe

Ulfur Hrobjartsson (ISL)

Oleg Ilyin (RUS) Representative of Group H - Euro-Asian

Rashid Al Kindi (UAE) Representative of Group I – Middle East and West Asia

Alternate for Sheikh Khaled Zayed S Alnehayyan (UAE)

Tong Yui Shing (HKG) Representatives of Group J - East Asia

Takao Otani (JPN) and for various items Hiromu Mochizuki (JPN) was Alternate

Ajay Narang (IND) Alternate for Abdur Rehman Arshad (PAK) Representative of Group K - South and Central Asia

Sarah Kenny (AUS) Representative of Group L - South West Pacific

John Tierney (COK)

Pablo Masseroni (ARG) Representative of Group M - South & West South America

Marco Aurelio de Sá Ribeiro (BRA) Representative of Group N – Central & East South America

Cary Lee Byerley (ANT) Representatives of Group O – North South America, Central America and Caribbean

Hector Duval (DOM)

Gary Bodie (USA) Representatives of Group P – North America

Peter Hall (CAN)

Cory Sertl (USA)

Mohamed Atbi (ALG) Representatives of Group Q - Africa

Philip Baum (RSA)

Betsy Alison (USA) Para World Sailing Representative

Matt Allen (AUS) Oceanic and Offshore Representative

Alternate for Stan Honey (USA)

Markus Schwendtner (GER) Classes Representative

Selma Altay Rodopman (TUR) Women’s Representative

Alternate for Elena Papazoglou (CYP)

Apologies

HM King Constantine President of Honour

HM King Harald of Norway President of Honour

W. Scott Perry Vice President
Also in Attendance

Alastair Fox  Director of Events
Carlos de Beltran  Head of Technical and Offshore
Daniel Smith  Communications Manager
Hugh Chambers  Chief Commercial Officer
Jon Napier  Director of Legal Affairs and Governance
Madeleine Dunn  Race Officials Manager
Massimo Dighe  Para World Sailing Manager
Rowena Farrugia  Business Operations Manager
Simon Forbes  Technical and Offshore Manager
Kendall Harris  Legal Counsel
Pedro Rodrigues  Events Manager
Elizabeth Owen  Social Media Executive
Matthew Wheaton  World Cup Executive
Hendrik Plate  Technical Specialist
Jaime Navarro  Technical Specialist
Natasha Keene  Head of Conferences & Hospitality
Megan Griggs  Race Officials Executive

1. Opening of the Meeting
   (a) Welcome from the President
       The President welcomed all present and thanked Visit Sarasota County for sponsoring the conference in Sarasota.
   (b) Apologies for Absence and Alternates
       Council noted the attendees at the meeting, the list of the alternates representing the permanent members of Council and noted the apologies from those members unable to attend.
   (c) Declarations of Interests
       Council noted the Register of Interest.
       Additional declarations of interest were made before discussing specific agenda items.

2. Report from the President
   Council received a report from the President.
   The President said that the Council meeting came at an important time for World Sailing. The discussions and decisions will have a great impact on the organisation and the sport of sailing as a whole. Over the last two years since taking over as President, World Sailing had made good progress, but it must do more.
Sailing in the Para Olympics

The President referred to the news that Para Sailing was not reinstated at the Paralympics. This was a deep shock for all of World Sailing, especially as World Sailing and its MNAs have made this area of development a priority. The President reinforced that this area should remain a priority – World Sailing has done a lot of good work in the last years and it must continue to build upon this. World Sailing did not do all this work just to get into the Paralympics, it did this to ensure that Para Sailing becomes a totally integrated part of the sport. The President said this work must continue, and while he knew that funding for these events will continue to be difficult, especially for MNAs who no longer benefit from the Paralympic funding, this is the reality and World Sailing needs to find ways to overcome this challenge.

The President informed Council that World Sailing has followed up with the IPC to get a better understanding of their evaluation. However, the evaluation report received from the IPC is not clear and, in the President’s view, contained inaccurate information and subjective judgements, instead of being based upon the facts.

The President reported that World Sailing can draw learnings from this experience. Para Sailing is developing better than ever before, and it is important that to keep this going, although it will be tough given the judgement by the IPC. But as World Sailing continues to look forward, it is also important that it continues to improve the way the information about the sport is communicated to partners. The IPC understood very little about the great sport of sailing and it is World Sailing’s job to make sure that they are given and understand the correct information.

Communication around World Sailing.

Ensuring that correct information is shared within World Sailing is vitally important. The President noted that recent months have seen an increase in spam and fake news being spread throughout the organisation. He felt this was very concerning and not good for the promotion of our sport. The way forward is through unity and transparency and the President stated this is what the leadership of World Sailing is committed to now and in the future.

The President also said that sailing is a sport that has values which match the profile of many stakeholders and sponsors. On top of the values that sailors bring, as a sport sailing also offers innovative and environmental elements that should make it possible to create a sound value proposition. However, like many other sports, sailing is struggling to get buy in from the outside. Everyone inside World Sailing understands the added value on offer, but World Sailing must find a way to improve its connection with stakeholders and sponsors to ensure that they also see the strong benefits that we can add to their brand.

Moving forward, the President suggested that World Sailing focusses on using its values to the benefit of the sport, sailors, event-organizers, clubs and MNAs. Looking at the data, World Sailing is doing fine but it needs to improve how it capitalizes on these values on all levels of our sport. Especially at events like this the Hempel World Championships in Århus. This year’s event in Århus was spectacular and the President said what a fantastic event it was. The size of this event is clearly challenging, but it only emphasizes how important it was for the host city and MNAs being involved directly with the organization of an event.

Turning to World Sailing’s finances, the President explained it is the Board’s goal to spend the funding available for the benefit of the sport and in the best possible way. Because of this, the budgeting process gives a loss every single year in the quadrennial other than the year of the Olympics. This has led to misinformation being circulated concluding and predicting a major financial crisis for World Sailing, leading to comments that support this misleading information (including concerning the location of the Executive Office).
The President clarified any misunderstanding by saying the Board reviewed cities that were measured against a set of criteria before deciding on London as the best option. The President was clear that World Sailing cannot manage the sport by costs alone: it must look at the total economics. Expressing concerns regarding lost sponsor income versus a commercial plan materializing at a slower pace than planned was a valid concern from Council members. The President assured Council that this was a high priority for the Board and the management team. However, the President also felt it was a balance when working on ways to drive the federation forward, while progressing the sport, and at the same time changing the business model to be less reliant on Olympic income.

The President noted that World Sailing has secured Hempel as a new Tier 1 sponsor. This was another great achievement and World Sailing now has an engaged sponsor who wants to be actively involved in our sport. This brings World Sailing’s Tier 1 sponsors to a total of four: SAP, Rolex, Volvo and Hempel (plus two Tier 2 sponsors: Zhik and GAC Pindar, and the North Sails sponsorship supporting the eWorld Sailing Championship).

Furthermore, the President reported that World Sailing has now established the World Sailing Trust. The Trust has three different funds focused on Sustainability, Youth and Access to Sailing / Connect to Sailing. Here the President thought that there is a good opportunity to leverage a programme for sailors for the next Youth Olympic Games as they are going to Senegal and Dakar in 2022.

Turning to competition law matters, the President reminded Council that inappropriately excluding competition from a market, or misusing a competitive advantage, raised important issues of concern. As an equipment-based sport, sailing must address these important issues. The President noted that World Sailing was proactively developing its strategy in this area and the policy approved by Council in May 2017 addresses 3 areas developed in conjunction with external lawyers specialising in EU law and sport:

a. Equipment re-evaluation
b. Olympic-Classes-Contracts
c. Ensuring evaluations for new equipment

In addition, the President reported that the Board has requested that a strategy is put forward by the Equipment Committee which will allow World Sailing to provide access to manufacturing of Olympic equipment to any interested party who is qualified by 2024. By the implementation of World Sailing Policy in May 2017 and the processes in action, the President was confident that World Sailing is fully compliant and committed to best practice. He reminded Council that decisions about to be made are taken within the frame of the policies being implemented so Council can focus on sports decisions while compliance is handled through the existing policies and processes.

Selecting Events and Equipment for the Paris Olympics 2024.

Coming out of any events or equipment decision for the Olympics, the President noted that many stakeholders felt the process was bad and there was too much lobbying and politics. The President drew the attention of Council to the responsibility of Council itself - it is here to set the direction for the future of our sport. And when talking about Olympics, this meant to showcase the sport and athletes in the best possible way.

By talking about the future, the President commented on the need to evolve and develop with the dilemma of having only ten slots available. Looking at the result of the decisions from May, it was clear that World Sailing adopted the strategy submissions on Gender equality for athletes and events, the direction having 4 mixed events and the need of covering different physics. But the President noted that World Sailing had ended up with a “mixed one-person event” as a result of the political lobbying. Looking at the submissions received and the discussions during the week in Sarasota, it was clear to the President that World Sailing is
struggling to come to terms with a mixed one-person event and the equipment for this event. Many MNAs have raised this matter with the Board and asked for guidance on the event in question and how to minimize change of equipment.

The President reported that the Board has had long discussions on how it could address the concerns raised and create the strongest events program to represent the great sport of sailing at the Olympics. After reflection, the Board proposed to re-open the decision for the mixed one-person event and request support from Council through Submission 037-18. The Board’s recommendation to minimize the change of equipment with respect to the approved events is then outlined in Submission 058-18.

With regards to IOC matters, the President reported that World Sailing has been able to build a constructive and positive level of contact with the IOC and ASOIF, both on the political level and administrative level and will continue to work on strengthening this relationship further. After the previous Council meeting, World Sailing has had several meetings with the IOC and the IOC President along with several colleagues visited us in Åarhus. During their visit, we discussed the information on events and disciplines chosen in May. The President noted that World Sailing is providing them with information and presentations on the history of sailing and the developments achieved as well as the new trends and future developments.

The President reported that the IOC had a very clear and positive feedback from their meeting with our sailors in Åarhus. In talking to sailors, topics such as gender equality and mixed sailing were brought up and there were some great takeaways from Åarhus for the IOC on the overall progress and direction of sailing.

Safety

The President reported that World Sailing has made good progress in the past year with implementing the mandatory incident reporting system. Incidents are reported on an online platform by MNA’s, Classes or other bodies and then reviewed on a monthly basis by the safety panel. The findings from investigations are shared on our website with the intent of sharing knowledge and best-practise and most importantly identifying changes that are required in equipment design and manufacture. The President urged Council all to pass on the information to your members that it is requirement under our regulations to report incidents.

Sustainability

The President went on to report that World Sailing has made significant progress with its sustainability strategy this year, following the unanimous approval by Council of Sustainability Agenda 2030. The Chief Executive Officer will provide a full update during his report, but there is no doubt that World Sailing is the leading sport across Olympic sports being certified in this area and recognised by the IOC and UN Environment for our work.

Regional Development

For quite some time now the President reported that there has been positive and constructive dialog about programs supported by the Emirates for Africa and Asia and with China supporting countries in the far-east. Sailing has a big potential in the regions just mentioned and with the right the engagement and support, he believed that World Sailing can excel in these areas. Furthermore, with the coming Olympics in Japan and the strong platform already existing in Singapore World Sailing should utilize the Olympics and the existing development to further increase momentum for our sport in the region. Also, with the next Youth Olympic Games in Doha 2022, we now have a once in a life time opportunity to increase participation in this continent enabling young athletes to compete in the qualifiers for the Paris Olympics 2024.
As the President looked to the future, he felt World Sailing must also discuss what the World Cup structure will look like after 2020. For many years World Sailing has been struggling with a World Cup format and the Ranking list. The World Cup on top or within the traditional graded events structure has proven to be difficult and the Ranking list fails with the structure of events. There is no doubt that World Sailing, Classes and event organizers need to plan better in-order for the sailors and MNAs to be able to reduce costs and for the sailor to get more time on the water. NOCs, MNA’s and sailors are caught off guard by mis-planned events, leading to large costs for running Olympic campaigns, as well as missed opportunities for new sailors to break into the “Olympic circuit”. As such, several stakeholders are being hurt, while World Sailing is only one stakeholder, it is the ones who should set the direction.

The President believed that the strategy should be to build on the strong platform of graded events where every year the pinnacle events would be the Classes World Championships and the World Cup final, with the Olympic Games rounding out the end of each quadrennial.

Lastly, the President addressed the Governance Commission. When starting the process, World Sailing supported this initiative as something of great importance for the future of World Sailing. Having started the process, World Sailing has had to agree on the priorities and a structure for discussion and this was a huge step in the right direction. World Sailing has focused on agility, transparency, inclusion, communication, and clear lines of responsibility. The President was happy to report that the Commission has delivered a solid working document and the Board fully endorsed the first report from Governance Commission. World Sailing has now spent time during this Conference together exchanging views and giving input and the President would like to thank everyone for the support. He noted there was a tight timeline planned, given the size of recommending and agreeing on a new structure, but the Board and the Commission are intent on keeping it.

The President thanked all World Sailing’s great sponsors for their support and engagement in securing the development of the sport. And lastly, he thanked everyone present, the committees, commissions, the World Sailing office and the Board for working so hard for the sport and for doing such a great job.

3. **Minutes of the Previous Meeting**

   (a) **May 2018 Council**

   The Council noted the minutes of Council’s meeting of 14 and 15 May 2018 (circulated and approved after the meeting).

   (b) **Board Minutes**

   The Council noted the minutes of the Board’s meetings of 10 & 11 May, 2 July, 2 August, 17 & 18 September and 1 October 2018.

4. **2024 Olympic Sailing Competition**

   (a) **Presentation from Paris 2024**

   Council received a presentation from Jean-Philippe Gatien, Director of Sports at Paris 2024.

   (b) **Submission 037-18**

   **Decision**

   On a proposal from Marcus Spillane, seconded by Hans Natorp, more than 75% of Council agreed to consider changing the Mixed One Person Dinghy event for the 2024 Olympic Sailing Competition.
(31 in favour, 8 against, 2 abstain – 41 participated)

**Decision**

On a proposal from Marcus Spillane, seconded by Hans Natorp, Council approved Proposal 2 in Submission 037-18.

(29 in favour, 9 against, 2 abstain – 40 participated)

(c) Olympic Equipment Strategy – Equipment Committee Recommendation

**Decision**

On a proposal from Timo Hass, seconded by Ulfur Hrobjartsson, Council approved the recommendation.

(36 in favour, 0 against, 3 abstain – 39 participated)

(d) Men and Women’s Windsurfer

Council considered the Equipment Committee recommendation to approve Submission 091-18 (as amended).

**Decision**

On a proposal from Cory Sertl, seconded by Marcus Spillane, Council against Submission 091-18.

(9 in favour, 28 against, 2 abstain – 39 participated)

(e) Mixed Two Person Dinghy

Council considered the Equipment Committee recommendation to approve Submission 058-18 in relation to the Mixed Two Person Dinghy.

**Decision**

On a proposal from Ulfur Hrobjartsson, seconded by Marcus Spillane, Council approved Submission 058-18 in respect of the Mixed Two Person Dinghy Equipment Criteria.

(33 in favour, 3 against, 2 abstain – 38 participated)

(f) Mixed Kite

Council considered the Equipment Committee recommendation to approve Submission 097-18 in relation to the Mixed Kite.

**Decision**

On a proposal from Cary Lee Byerley, seconded by Gary Bodie, Council approved Submission 097-18 in respect of the Mixed Kite Equipment Criteria.

(31 in favour, 3 against, 4 abstain – 38 participated)

---

1 Post meeting note: Hector Duval, Peter Hall, Georgy Wossala and Zvi Ziblat proposed that the draft minutes be amended on the grounds their vote had been incorrectly recorded. Having considered the proposed amendment and a review of the voting records, the Chairman has approved the minutes without amendment.

2 Post meeting note: Hector Duval and Georgy Wossala proposed that the draft minutes be amended on the grounds their vote had been incorrectly recorded. Having considered the proposed amendment and a review of the voting records, the Chairman has approved the minutes without amendment.

3 Post meeting note: Georgy Wossala proposed that the draft minutes be amended on the grounds his vote had been incorrectly recorded. Having considered the proposed amendment and a review of the voting records, the Chairman has approved the minutes without amendment.
(g) Mixed Two Person Keelboat Offshore

Council considered the Equipment Committee recommendation to approve Submission 058-18 in relation to the Mixed Two Person Keelboat Offshore.

**Decision**

On a proposal from Dick Batt, seconded by Marcus Spillane, Council approved Submission 058-18 in respect of the Mixed Two Person Keelboat Offshore Equipment Criteria.

(30 in favour, 2 against, 6 abstain – 38 participated)

All other submissions made under Regulation 23 for the 2024 Olympic Equipment, with the exception of those concerning the Men and Women’s Windsurfer, were deemed rejected.

(h) Ballots

Council considered a recommendation from the Equipment Committee.

**Decision**

On a proposal from Peter Hall, seconded by Dick Batt, Council approved that when considering all submissions in relation to Men and Women’s Windsurfer, all amendments suggested by the Constitution Committee which would render a submission valid (where it was previously determined to be invalid) should be accepted.

(32 in favour, 0 against, 7 abstain)

Council proceeded to conduct a ballot in relation to the Men and Women’s Windsurfer Equipment.

The following submissions received a proposer and a seconder and were included on the ballot: 058-18, 091-18, 092-18 and 100-18. All other submissions concerning the Men and Women’s Windsurfer were deemed rejected.

Council proceeded to a ballot. The following votes were received:

- Submission 058-18: 29 votes
- Submission 091-18: 0 votes
- Submission 092-18: 5 votes
- Submission 100-18: 4 votes
- Abstentions: 2
- Invalid vote: 1

**Decision**

Council approved Submission 058-18 with respect to the Men and Women’s Windsurfer and rejected Submissions 091-18, 092-18 and 100-18.

Following a request from George Wossala under Regulation 3.2.4, the votes of Council Members concerning Regulation 23 are attached to these Minutes at Appendix 1.
5. **Submissions**

(a) Submissions for which the Board is the Reporting Committee

(i) Submissions 001-18 – World Sailing Finances – Financial Statement and Budget

**Decision**

On a proposal from Marcus Spillane, seconded by Peter Hall, Council approved Submission 001-18 with the following amendment:

To propose a white paper policy that World Sailing send to the MNAs, other Members, Council members and committee chairs the draft management financial statements for latest available month end for the calendar year and budget for the next 12 months, at least 14 days before the first day of the Council meetings at the Annual Conference.

(38 in favour, 0 against, 0 abstain – 38 participated)

(ii) Submission 002-18 – World Sailing Annual Conference – Publication of Submissions

**Decision**

On a proposal from Peter Hall, seconded by Dick Batt, Council approved Submission 002-18.

(37 in favour, 2 against, 0 abstain – 39 participated)

(iii) Submission 003-18 – Making World Sailing More Relevant to Sailors – New Working Party

**Decision**

On a proposal from Markus Schwendtner, seconded by Zvi Ziblat, Council rejected Submission 003-18.

(5 in favour, 30 against, 4 abstain – 39 participated)

(iv) Submission 004-18 – World Sailing Constitution – Powers of Board and Council - Article 41

**Decision**

On a proposal from Zvi Ziblat, seconded by Markus Schwendtner, Council rejected Submission 004-18.

(7 in favour, 29 against, 3 abstain – 39 participated)

(v) Submission 005-18 – World Sailing Annual Conference – Bid Process

**Decision**

On a proposal from Hector Duval, seconded by Cary Lee Byerley, Council rejected Submission 005-18.

(12 in favour, 24 against, 2 abstain – 38 participated)

(vi) Submission 006-18 – World Sailing Annual Conference – Bid Process

The submission was withdrawn by the submitter.

(vii) Submission 007-18 – Olympic Events & Equipment – Prohibition on Electronic Voting
Decision
On a proposal from Cary Lee Byerley, seconded by Zvi Ziblat, Council rejected Submission 007-18.
(11 in favour, 29 against, 1 abstain – 41 participated)

(viii) Submission 008-18 – World Sailing Regulations – Olympic Equipment – Regulation 23.1.8
There was no proposer for the submission, which was therefore not discussed.

(ix) Submission 009-18 – Sailor Classification Code – Change of Terminology
The submission was withdrawn by the submitter.

(x) Submission 010-18 – World Sailing Special Events – Obligations and Consequences for Non-Compliance
There was no seconder for the submission, which was therefore not discussed.

(xi) Submission 011-18 – Approval Fees – Prize Money

Decision
On a proposal from Marcus Spillane, seconded by Dick Batt, Council approved Submission 011-18.
(35 in favour, 3 against, 1 abstain – 39 participated)

(xii) Submission 012-18 – 2020 Olympic Sailing Competition – Support to Continental Qualification Events

Decision
On a proposal from Markus Schwendtner, seconded by Marcus Spillane, Council rejected Submission 012-18.
(11 in favour, 27 against, 2 abstain – 30 participated)

(xiii) Submission 013-18 – Equipment for Olympics, WS Events and Regional Games – Antitrust Compliance
There was no proposer for the submission, which was therefore not discussed.

(xiv) Submission 014-18 – Olympic Equipment – New Regulation 23.1.10

Decision
On a proposal from Georgy Wossala, seconded by Zvi Ziblat, Council rejected Submission 014-18.
(7 in favour, 33 against, 0 abstain – 40 participated)

(xv) Submission 015-18 – World Sailing Anti-Trust Policy – Placing 49er and 49erFX Under Review
Marcus Spillane appointed Harry Hermon as his alternate for this item.
There was no seconder for the submission, which was therefore not discussed.

(xvi) Submission 016-18 – World Sailing Anti-Trust Policy – Placing 49er, 49erFX and Nacra 17 Under Review
Marcus Spillane appointed Harry Hermon as his alternate for this item.
There was no proposer for the submission, which was therefore not discussed.
(xvii) Submission 017-18 – World Sailing Regulations – Classification Code - Regulation 22.2.1 and 22.2.2

**Decision**

On a proposal from Philip Baum, seconded by Peter Hall, Council approved Proposal 1 (33 in favour, 3 reject, 3 abstain – 39 participated) and approved Proposal 2 (29 in favour, 9 reject, 3 abstain – 41 participated).

(b) Submissions for which the Constitution Committee is the Reporting Committee:

(i) Submission 027-18 – World Sailing Members – Cancellation of RUS Membership

Oleg Ilyin appointed Tatiana Ermakova (RUS) as his Alternate for this item.

The Chairman of the Constitution Committee reported to Council that, following discussions with the parties, the Committee recommended the submission be deferred to November 2019.

The submitter confirmed that it supported the Constitution Committee’s recommendation to defer the submission.

**Decision**

On a proposal from Gary Bodie, seconded by Peter Hall, Council deferred Submission 027-18 to November 2019.

(35 in favour, 5 against, 0 abstain – 40 participated)

(ii) Submission 028-18 – World Sailing Constitution – Revert to 2011 Constitution

There was no seconder for the submission, which was therefore not discussed.

(iii) Submission 029-18 – World Sailing Constitution & Regulations – Revert to 2012 Constitution & Regulations

The submission was withdrawn by the submitter.

(iv) Submission 030-18 – World Sailing Regulations – Olympic Equipment – Regulation 23.1.6

**Decision**

On a proposal from Georgy Wossala, seconded by Zvi Ziblat, Council rejected Submission 030-18

(5 in favour, 32 against, 3 abstain – 40 participated)

(v) Submission 031-18

The submission was withdrawn by the submitter.

(vi) Submission 032-18 – World Sailing Regulations – Conduct of WS Members - Regulation 35.2

**Decision**

On a proposal from Hans Natorp, seconded by Marcus Spillane, Council approved Submission 032-18 with the following amendments:

(a) any competitor, boat owner, and or support person; and

(b) any World Sailing Council, committee or commission member, working party member, (including any alternates appointed), World Sailing Member (including any representatives sent by a Member to attend World Sailing Events, meetings, or other official functions), World Sailing Officer, World Sailing Race Official, or
World Sailing Representative or any person, official or body subject to the World Sailing Constitution or World Sailing Regulations.

...
Committee. The Board shall consult the relevant Olympic class association(s) before making any decision. In deciding on the names, the Board shall have regard to:

(34 in favour, 3 against, 1 abstain – 38 participated)

(d) Submissions for which the Equipment Committee is the Reporting Committee (non-Regulation 23):

(i) Submission 110-18 – World Championships – Participation Requirements for Large Keelboats – Regulation 10.4(b)

Decision
On a proposal from Dick Batt, seconded by Markus Schwendtner, Council rejected Submission 110-18.

(5 in favour, 31 against, 3 abstain – 39 participated)

(ii) Submission 111-18 – Olympic Equipment – Onboard Technology

Decision
On a proposal from Gary Bodie, seconded by Sarah Kenny, Council rejected Submission 111-18.

(7 in favour, 29 against, 3 abstain – 39 participated)

(iii) Submissions 112-18 to 123-18

Decision
On a proposal by Zvi Ziblat, seconded by Josep M. Pla, Council approved the Equipment Committee recommendations on Submissions 112-18 to 123-18 en bloc.

(34 in favour, 3 against, 0 abstain – 37 participated)

(e) Submissions for which the Race Officials Committee is the Reporting Committee

(i) Submissions 129-18 to 131-18

Decision
On a proposal from Peter Hall, seconded by Marcus Spillane, Council approved Submissions 129-18 to 131-18 en bloc.

(39 in favour, 0 against, 0 abstain – 39 participated)

(f) Racing Rules Submissions

(i) Submission 137-18 – World Sailing Regulations – Racing Rules Committee - Regulations 6.11 & 28

Decision
On a proposal from Kamen Fillyov, seconded by Marcus Spillane, Council approved Submission 137-18.

(39 in favour, 0 against, 1 abstain – 40 participated)

There were no submissions concerning the Racing Rules of Sailing referred to Council under Regulation 28.

6. Finance

(a) 2018 Management Accounts
The Chief Executive Officer presented the income and expenditure statement for the period 1 January to 31 August 2018.

(b) 2019 Budget and latest quadrennial budget forecast
The Chief Executive Officer presented the 2019 Budget and updated quadrennial budget for 2017 – 2020.

(c) Trust Report
The Chief Executive Officer informed Council of the level of funds held in the World Sailing Investment Trust.

(d) Debtors List
The unpaid MNAs and Class Subscriptions were noted.

7. **CEO Report and Commercial Update**

(a) **CEO Report**
The Chief Executive Officer presented his report to Council.

(b) **Commercial Report**
A presentation on the commercial progress of World Sailing was given by the Chief Executive Officer.

(c) **Stakeholder Satisfaction Survey Findings**
The Chief Executive Officer presented the Stakeholder Satisfaction Survey results.

8. **Members**

(a) **Suspended Members**
Council noted the following suspended members:
- Federacao Angolana de Vela
- Botswana Yacht Racing Association
- Federation Djiboutienne de Voile et des Sports Nautique
- Kenya Yachting Association
- Kosovo Sailing Federation
- Libyan Sailing Federation
- Madagascar Yachting and Rowing Squad
- Mauritius Yachting Association
- Panama Sailing Association
- Federation Senegalaise De Voile
- Sudan Sailing Federation
- St Vincent and Grenadines Sailing Association
- Sailing Association of Zimbabwe

(b) **Governance Commission**
Council received a report from Maria Clarke, Independent Chair of the Governance Commission.
9. **Events**

The Director of Events reported on the following events:

(a) 2018 Sailing World Championships (Aarhus, DEN)
(b) 2018 Youth Sailing World Championships (Corpus Christi, USA)
(c) 2018 Para World Sailing Championships (Sheboygan, USA)
(d) 2018 Youth Olympic Games (Buenos Aires, ARG)
(e) 2018 – 2020 World Cup Series
(f) 2019 Youth Sailing World Championships (Gdynia, POL)
(g) 2019 Olympic Test Event (Enoshima, JPN)
(h) 2020 Olympic Sailing Competition (Enoshima, JPN)
(i) 2024 Olympic Sailing Competition (Marseille, FRA)

10. **Reports and Recommendations Not Based On Submission**

Council received reports from the following Committees and considered the following recommendations not based on submission:

(a) Audit Committee – Jan Dawson on behalf of Phil Cotton

There were no recommendations not based on submissions from the Audit Committee.

(b) Board – Kim Andersen

   (i) Council received a recommendation from the Board that the Code of Ethics is amended to insert new section 1.9 and re-numbed as follows:

   **1.9 Sanctions**

   The following sanctions are available for a breach of the Code of Ethics:

   (a) no sanction;
   (b) a warning, admonishment or reprimand;
   (c) a fine not exceeding €1000;
   (d) a direction not to compete or officiate in a particular event or class (or types of event or classes);
   (e) suspension or revocation of Competition Eligibility and/or World Sailing Eligibility (or the imposition of conditions on such Eligibility);
   (f) suspension or removal from office in the case of World Sailing officers or World Sailing Representatives;
   (g) suspension or removal of a certificate of appointment in the case of World Sailing Race Officials (or the imposition of conditions on such appointment);
   (h) [Not used]
   (i) make a report to a Member National Authority, World Sailing Class, World Sailing (under another Regulation or the Racing Rule of Sailing) or any other appropriate organisation; and/or
   (j) any other sanction which it is within the powers of World Sailing to impose.
**Decision**

On a proposal from Marcus Spillane, seconded by Peter Hall, Council approved the recommendation.

(38 in favour, 0 against, 2 abstain – 40 participated)

(ii) Council received a recommendation that the Governance Commission’s terms of reference are amended as follows:

3 Following consultation with Council, the Board will propose any reforms to the Annual General Meeting in November **2018 2019**.

6 [Insert list of members as new section 6, re-number and add:]

*Members of the Commission are not representatives of any MNA or other stakeholder within World Sailing and participate in the Commission in their personal capacities.*

7.6 Report to the Board and Council in May **2018 2019** with the changes proposed in principle so that they are in final form for the September **2018 2019** Board meeting (and then consideration and review at the **2018 2019** Annual Conference (November)).

**Decision**

On a proposal from Marcus Spillane, seconded by Markus Schwendtner, Council approved the recommendation.

(37 in favour, 0 against, 3 abstain – 40 participated)

(iii) Council received a recommendation from the Board that World Sailing should proceed to select new equipment with an additional recommendation that the existing equipment (Laser/ILCA) is included as a full option in this process.

**Decision**

On a proposal from Marcus Spillane, seconded by Peter Hall, Council approved the recommendation.

(33 in favour, 2 against, 4 abstain – 39 participated)

(c) Constitution Committee – Graham McKenzie

There were no recommendations not based on submissions from the Constitution Committee.

(d) Development & Regions Committee – David Covo

Council received a recommendation from the Development & Regions Committee that:

1. the budget of Training and Development be restored as a matter of urgency, and

2. priority be assigned to the search for new sources of funding that will enable further growth and expansion of our training and development programs.

**Decision**

On a proposal from Peter Hall, seconded by Timo Hass, Council approved the recommendation.

(36 in favour, 3 against, 1 abstain – 40 participated)
(e) Equipment Committee - Dina Kowalyshyn

(i) Council that received a recommendation from the Equipment Committee that all the following classes are given World Sailing status (subject to signing contract):

- Diam 24 deferred Class Application
- International Windsurfer Class Application
- International Twelve Metre Class Application per Division

**Decision**

On a proposal from Zvi Ziblat, seconded by Sarah Kenny, Council approved the recommendation.

(35 in favour, 2 against, 2 abstain – 39 participated)

(ii) Council received a recommendation from the Equipment Committee to approve the Olympic Equipment Re-evaluation Procedure: Windsurfer Event.

**Decision**

On a proposal from Dick Batt, seconded by Peter Hall, Council approved the recommendation.

(36 in favour, 1 against, 3 abstain – 40 participated).

(f) Events Committee – Sarah Kenny

Council received a recommendation from the Events Committee that the format for the Mixed Multihull event for the 2020 Olympic Games be as set out below:

In line with decisions made for the Windsurfer and Skiff events the Mixed Multihull Format for the Tokyo 2020 Olympic Sailing Competition should be:

- Opening series: 12 races / 30 minute target time
- Medal race: 1 standard medal race / 20 minute target time

**Decision**

On a proposal from Marcus Spillane, seconded by Hector Duval, Council approved the recommendation.

(38 in favour, 0 against, 1 abstain – 39 participated)

(g) Oceanic & Offshore Committee – Matt Allen on behalf of Stan Honey

Council received a report from Matt Allen on behalf of the Committee Chair, Stan Honey.

There are no recommendations not based on submissions from the Oceanic & Offshore Committee.

(h) Para World Sailing Committee – Betsy Alison

Council received a report from Committee Chair, Betsy Alison.

There were no recommendations not based on submissions from the Para World Sailing Committee.

(i) Race Officials Committee – Jan Stage

There were no recommendations not based on submissions from the Race Officials Committee.

(j) Racing Rules Committee – John Doerr
Council received a report from Committee Chair, John Doerr.
There were no recommendations not based on submissions from the Racing Rules Committee.

(k) Women’s Forum – Selma Altay Rodopman on behalf of Elena Papazoglou
Council received a report from Selma Altay Rodopman, on behalf of Committee Chair Elena Papazoglou.
There were no recommendations not based on submissions from the Women’s Forum.

(l) World Sailing Classes Committee – Markus Schwendtner
Council received a report from Committee Chair, Markus Schwendtner.
Council received the following recommendations from the World Sailing Classes Committee:

(i) for Youth and Junior Classes that are recognised on one or more MNA Olympic pathways, World and Regional championships are co-ordinated to minimise conflicts both for the sailors and officials;

(ii) that a working party be formed with members of the classes, race officials committee to address the subject.

(iii) that the WS race management policies are adapted with the Olympic Classes specific Race Management policies for the sake consistency.

(iv) that World Cup events maximise a level playing field with adequate equipment inspection (IM and process), and the inclusion of more experienced class specific jury; and

(v) that the decision taken in November 2016 about the rankings of crews be urgently implemented.

Decision
On a proposal from Markus Schwendtner, seconded by Marcus Spillane, Council approved the recommendations.
(38 in favour, 0 against, 2 abstain – 40 participated).

11. Any Other Business
Peter van den Bossche raised the issue of race official clothing for race officials.
The President noted that the next Council meeting will be on 18 & 19 May 2019.

There being no other business, the President thank the Council for their work and dedication to the sport. The President also thanked Sarasota and US Sailing for hosting the conference and closed the meeting.

Kim Andersen
President
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rodopman</td>
<td>Selma Altay</td>
<td>Reject</td>
<td>Reject</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Reject</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>058-18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Otani/Mochizuki</td>
<td>Takao/Hiromu</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Reject</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>058-18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shing</td>
<td>Oleg Yui</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Abstain</td>
<td>Reject</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>058-18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ilyin</td>
<td>Oleg Yui</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Reject</td>
<td>Reject</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>058-18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tierney</td>
<td>John</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>100-18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kenny</td>
<td>Sarah</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>100-18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>van den Bossche</td>
<td>Peter</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>092-18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aurelio de Sa Ribeiro</td>
<td>Marco</td>
<td>Reject</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Reject</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ziblat</td>
<td>Zvi</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Reject</td>
<td>Abstain</td>
<td>Reject</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Reject</td>
<td>Reject</td>
<td>Abstain</td>
<td>058-18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Henard</td>
<td>Nicolas</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Reject</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>058-18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cavallucci</td>
<td>Walter</td>
<td>Reject</td>
<td>Reject</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Reject</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>058-18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hall</td>
<td>Peter</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Reject</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>058-18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sertl</td>
<td>Cory</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>058-18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bodie</td>
<td>Gary</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>058-18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wossala</td>
<td>Georgy</td>
<td>Abstain</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Reject</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Abstain</td>
<td>Abstain</td>
<td>Abstain</td>
<td>100-18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hass</td>
<td>Timo</td>
<td>Reject</td>
<td>Reject</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Reject</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Abstain</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>058-18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grael</td>
<td>Torben</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Reject</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>058-18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rocherieux</td>
<td>Yann</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Reject</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>058-18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Li</td>
<td>Quanhai</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Reject</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Abstain</td>
<td>Abstain</td>
<td>058-18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sanchez</td>
<td>Ana</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Reject</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>058-18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Andersen</td>
<td>Kim</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Reject</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>058-18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stegenwalner</td>
<td>Nadine</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Abstain</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Reject</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>058-18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jobson</td>
<td>Gary</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Reject</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>058-18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Name</td>
<td>First</td>
<td>Last</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>---------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dawson</td>
<td>Jan</td>
<td></td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Reject</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Reject</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Batt</td>
<td>Dick</td>
<td></td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Reject</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spillane/Hermon</td>
<td>Marcus/Harry</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Reject</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Atbi</td>
<td>Mohamed</td>
<td></td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Reject</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Baum</td>
<td>Philip</td>
<td></td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Reject</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chemera</td>
<td>Tomasz</td>
<td></td>
<td>Reject</td>
<td>Reject</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Reject</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Abstain</td>
<td>Approve</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fillyov</td>
<td>Kamen</td>
<td></td>
<td>Reject</td>
<td>Reject</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Byerley</td>
<td>Cary Lee</td>
<td></td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Reject</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Abstain</td>
<td>Abstain</td>
<td>Abstain</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Duval</td>
<td>Hector</td>
<td></td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Reject</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Reject</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Reject</td>
<td>Abstain</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pla</td>
<td>Josep M</td>
<td></td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Abstain</td>
<td>Abstain</td>
<td>Abstain</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Masseroni</td>
<td>Pablo</td>
<td></td>
<td>Reject</td>
<td>Reject</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Reject</td>
<td>Reject</td>
<td>Abstain</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hrobjartsson</td>
<td>Ulfur</td>
<td></td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Reject</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Natorp</td>
<td>Hans</td>
<td></td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Reject</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Narang</td>
<td>Ajay</td>
<td></td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Reject</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alkindi</td>
<td>Rachid</td>
<td></td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Reject</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Abstain</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Schwendtner</td>
<td>Markus</td>
<td></td>
<td>Abstain</td>
<td>Abstain</td>
<td>Abstain</td>
<td>Abstain</td>
<td>Abstain</td>
<td>Abstain</td>
<td>Abstain</td>
<td>Abstain</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Allen</td>
<td>Matt</td>
<td></td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alison</td>
<td>Betsy</td>
<td></td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>Approve</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>32</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reject</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abstain</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>